DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 352 976 IR 054 326

AUTHOR Andelson, Eric
TITLE A Study of Graphic Novel Cataloging Records.
PUB DATE Feb 92
NOTE 93p.; Master's Thesis, Kent State University.
PUB TYPE Dissertations/Theses - Masters Theses (042)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC04 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS Bibliographic Utilities; *Cataloging; College Libraries; Higher Education; Library Research; Online Catalogs; Online Searching; Research Methodology; Statistical Analysis; *Subject Index Terms; Tables (Data)
IDENTIFIERS Bowling Green State University OH; *Graphic Novels; OCLC; Statistical Package for the Social Sciences

ABSTRACT

Graphic novels are a blending of words and art in which the illustrations bear the same relationship to the text that a film carries to its screenplay. The hypothesis of this research is that, as a new form of literature, graphic novels will display inconsistent cataloging. Methodology consisted of searching the titles generated from Bowling Green State University's subject heading, Graphic Novels, against OCLC records. There are 191 titles, with 299 OCLC records and 3,416 holdings. All records for the same title were downloaded from OCLC, encoded, and entered into SPSS. Statistical analysis such as tabulating and frequency distribution are utilized in analyzing the cataloging records. Definitions, examples, AACR2 cataloging rules, subject headings, added entries, and classification numbers clarify the format as well as the cataloging of graphic novels. One conclusion is that there are consistencies as well as inconsistencies in the cataloging record. Another is that graphic novels are not automatically considered juvenile works. Several recommendations based on the study findings are offered: (1) "chiefly ill." should be used in the physical field; (2) a subject heading "Graphic Novels" should be assigned in order to bring out this form of literature; (3) libraries may want to class graphic novels together locally; and (4) more individuals and roles should be listed in the statement of responsibility or notes. An appendix lists the titles of the graphic novels used for analysis. Thirteen computer/CD-Rom citations and seven catalogs are listed in addition to 32 references. (Author/ALF)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☐ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

ED352976

A STUDY OF GRAPHIC NOVEL CATALOGING RECORDS

A Masters Research Paper submitted to the
Kent State University School of Library Science
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree Master of Library Science

by

Eric Andelson

February 1992

12054326

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Eric Andelson

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

A STUDY OF GRAPHIC NOVEL CATALOGING RECORDS

by

Eric Andelson

ABSTRACT

Graphic novels are a blending of words and art. The illustrations in a graphic novel bear the same relationship to the text that a film carries to its screenplay. The hypothesis is that as a new form of literature, graphic novels will display inconsistent cataloging. The Bowling Green State University Popular Culture Library uses the Subject Heading "**Graphic Novels**. The titles generated from BGSU's Subject Heading were searched against OCLC records. There are 191 titles, with 299 OCLC records and 3416 holdings. All records for the same title were downloaded from OCLC, encoded and entered into SPSS. Statistical analysis such as tabulating and frequency distribution are utilized in analyzing the cataloging records. Definitions, examples, AACR2 cataloging rules, subject headings, added entries, classification numbers, etc. clarify the format as well as the cataloging of graphic novels. One conclusion is that there are consistencies as well as inconsistencies in the cataloging record. Another is that graphic novels are not automatically considered juvenile works. A subject heading **Graphic Novels** should be assigned in order to bring out the form of the literature.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION.....1

2. REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

A. Definitions of the Graphic Novel.....4

B. Bibliographic control.....10

C. Cataloging Questions

1) Format.....15
2) Access Points.....16
3) Classification.....17
4) Illustration.....18
5) Seriality.....19

3. METHODOLOGY.....20

A. Coding Form.....23

4. LIST OF TABLES

Table
1. Number of OCLC records per title.....24
2. The year entered in OCLC.....27
3. The form of **ill.** in OCLC.....29
4. The value of **F** in **F/M/B**.....33
5. Intellectual level: **Int lvl**.....35
6. Translated.....37
7A. LC number.....39
7A1. LC number if known translation.....39
7B. LC classification.....40
7B1. LC classification (if fiction).....40
8. Dewey number.....45
8A. Dewey number (if fiction).....45
9. Other form.....48
10. "Graphic novel" mentioned in.....50
11. Number of Subject Headings.....52
11A. Number of SH not visual in type.....52
11B. Number of SH (if fiction).....53
12. Total number of people responsible.....55
13. Are all "roles" indicated.....55
14. Total number of people traced.....55
15. Mentioned in record, but not traced.....57
16. Holdings records.....60

5. CONCLUSION.....62

6. APPENDIX 1.....64

Graphic novel titles used for analysis

7. Bibliography.....85

INTRODUCTION

Graphic novels are a form in which graphic narration and text are combined in such a way that neither can survive without the other. They share, with novels, a beginning, middle and end. They range from a trade paperback reprint of a comic book to serious literary works. As of this moment, there is no single definition for the form.

Graphic novels are becoming popular in America. They are entering the world of mainstream publishing, are appearing in bookstores, and are bought and cataloged by libraries. Warner Brothers, Fawcett, and Simon & Schuster are among the large houses publishing graphic novels. The book chain, Waldenbooks, has a "Graphic Novels" section, and the Library of Congress is currently cataloging them.[1]

Graphic novels have been published in Europe and Asia since World War II, but not until the late 1970's, have they been published in any number in the U.S.A.. It is only in the last few years that the general public has become aware of them. As late as 1989, a reviewer identified Maus, published in 1986, as the first graphic novel. "What...Spiegelman has done is the seemingly impossible: He has fused the novel and the

---

1. The Library of Congress has revised cataloging priorities including minimal-level cataloging. Graphic novels are not expressly listed, but are likely to be affected by the revisions. Cataloging Priorities and Levels of Cataloging, Cataloging Service Bulletin, Winter 1991, 3-7.

cartoon...."[1]

An important reason for the late arrival of graphic novels in our country was the publication of Fredric Wertham's book, Seduction of the Innocent, in which he linked comics and juvenile delinquency, a theory popular in the 1950's.[2] The ensuing uproar resulted in a "Comics Code Authority" which limited the nature of comics to material deemed suitable to children and juveniles.

The Code banned inflammatory words such as "Fear", "Horror", "Weird", and "Terror" from titles.[3] They had stories changed in order to ensure that the "good guys" won.[4] A criminal not only had to lose, but could not commit a realistic crime.[5] Social problems such as prostitution, racism, and drug abuse were taboo. The Code has changed since its inception, but it is still in existence.

> Between 1940 and the early sixties the industry commonly accepted the profile of the comic book reader as that of a '10-year old from Iowa.' In adults the reading of comic books was regarded as a sign of low intelligence. Publishers neither encouraged nor

---

[1]Dreifus, Claudia. "An Interview with Art Spiegelman." Progressive November 1989: 34.

[2]·Wertham, Fredric. Seduction of the Innocent. New York: Rinehart, 1954.

[3]·Thompson, Don. "The spawn of the son of M.C. Gaines" The comic-book book, 312.

[4]·ibid. 314.

[5]·Code for Editorial Matter, General Standards. Part A: #2. "No comics shall explicitly present the unique details and methods of a crime".

supported anything more.[1]

The situation has changed. Waldenbooks states, "...research indicates that those buying comics these days are in their 20's and 30's."; furthermore, the adult reader now has comics and graphic novels aimed towards him/her.[2] This trend has lead to graphic novels deserving consideration as serious works.

Cataloging problems emerge when standard conventions are used to describe a new form. Questions arise in definition, subject headings, terminology, and physical description. A systematic analysis of the cataloging records of identified graphic novels will help define the term as well as point out inconsistencies in cataloging records.

---

1. Eisner, Will. Comics & Sequential Art. Tamarac, Florida: Poorhouse Press, 1985: 138.

2. Condon, Garret. "Graphic Novels Appeal to New Generation of Comic-Book Readers." [vertical file at OSU]

REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

A. Definitions of the Graphic Novel

Definitions are in a state of flux. There is no single definition for the graphic novel that satisfies everyone. In the comic world, whose publications (fanzines) can be considered part of the alternative press it is a source of continuous debate. There are articles on graphic novels by the mainstream press, but the definition of the term is often assumed. One of the first, semi-formal definitions in mainstream publishing, appeared in Publishers Weekly in 1987.[1]

The author, George Beahm, is director of marketing for a company that produces and sells graphic novels. He addresses some of the problems in defining them:

> The graphic novel is, in short, a new format with an identity problem, handicapped by preconceived notions. The erroneous assumption: because a graphic novel uses comic art as its medium of expression, many don't take it seriously.
>
> They are not slick comic books for kids or adults whose lips move when they read.
>
> Graphic novels are not comics or magazines.
>
> Graphic novels are not necessarily about comic book superheroes.
>
> Graphic novels are not simple stories simply told.[2]

Beahm's company, Donning Company Publishers, and its imprint, Starblaze, published some of the graphic novels used in

---

[1]Beahm, George. "Graphic Novels: Comics, Magazines, or Books?" Publishers Weekly November 6, 1987: 22.

[2]ibid.

this masters paper. Appendix I contains the list of all graphic novels analyzed in this study. Some examples from the Donning Company are titles #2, 135, & 185.

Bodian's Publishing Desk Reference: A Comprehensive Dictionary of Practices and Techniques for Book and Journal Marketing and Bookselling was published in 1988.[1] Bodian's definition of the graphic novel cites Beahm's 1987 article:

> **GRAPHIC NOVEL** A short novel that tells its story through comic artwork, typically in trade paperback format (7"x10" or 8 1/2x11"), usually in full color, and priced from $6.95 to $12.95. A comic novel combines prose and the visual excitement of artwork. Usually a minimum of 64 pages, but can extend to over 100 pages depending on the story.[2]

Virtually every article on graphic novels has its own definition. In 1989, Gregory Walker reviews some graphic novels for Booklist.[3]

> Graphic novels... are the most sophisticated form of comics art. Similar to novelettes and short stories in length and narrative style, they set new visual standards with artwork that rivals the best in children's books and paperback covers.[4]

Graphic novels mentioned in Walker's review are titles #9, 20, 55, 73, 154, 186, & 191 of this paper.

---

[1]Bodian, Nat G. Bodian's Publishing Desk Reference: A Comprehensive Dictionary of Practices and Techniques for Book and Journal Marketing and Bookselling. Phoenix: Oryx Press, 1988. 154.

[2]ibid., 154.

[3]Walker, Gregory. "Comics and Graphic Novels." Booklist April 1, 1989: 1370-1374.

[4]ibid., 1370.

In order to catalog them, some libraries have had to create a working definition for the graphic novel, due to the lack of a standard for the genre. An example is the Popular Culture Library at Bowling Green State University, Bowling Green, Ohio. Their definition, adopted in November 1987, lead to a locally assigned subject heading of "Graphic Novels". Note that their definition also mentions Beahm's article. A list compiled from Bowling Green's subject heading forms the graphic novels analyzed in this paper.

GRAPHIC NOVELS

1. The graphic novel is both a "literary genre/form" as well as a "publication format." It is a hybrid genre, most easily described as a novel or collection of short stories in comic-book format, but with fuller plots and characterization, and more narrative cohesion than conventional serialized comic books. The graphic novel is both a literary genre (in form, technique, and subject matter), as well as a publication format.... Graphic novels may focus on may different kinds of content -- fiction, as well as non-fiction. ...-- these may be traditional popular novels that have been adapted and re-released in the graphic novel format with elaborate illustrations, or may be independent stories that can stand alone, but that compromise an important part of a fictional character's mythos. Other graphic novels more clearly related to conventional comic books. These include comic books re-released in the graphic novel format (i.e., six Superman issues reprinted in one hardbound volume) as well as new stories with new graphic art (i.e., a folio graphic novel featuring the Hulk's early years not treated in conventional comic books), or may be extensions of serially-published comic books (i.e., graphic novels may fill in the premiere or penultimate issue that has not been previously published in conventional comic book form).

2. Graphic novels can be distinguished from comic books primarily by their format and illustrative style (but this is not always the case). They can also be distinguished from comic books because they are usually novel-length,or are otherwise self-contained (i.e., in the case of a collection of stories). They are not 26/28 cm, pulp paper, regular serials, as are

conventional comic books.

3. See Publishers Weekly May 22, 1987 for a published, although not "scholarly" definition of graphic novels. BGSU never plays a "leadership role" in defining any comic-type materials.

4. I suggest that the Popular Culture Library's collection of graphic novels be classed in LC, and put on the regular shelves... They need to be brought together in the card and online catalogs with common added subject headings, and with series title tracings in the 440 field. In addition, we need to include data on the adaptor, artist, illustrator, editor, etc.[1]

Another library that has a locally assigned subject heading of "Graphic novels" is Hennepin County Library (Minnesota). The Authority record reads;

Graphic novels 105 095 966 VA H-50
pn here are entered novels in comic-art form, usually published as full-color trade paperbacks.
sa Cartoon novels. / Fotonovelas. / Movie novels. / Stories without words.
x Comic book novels. / Novels, graphic.
cn 80-4366260 HCL form.

Vendors sometimes bypass defining the product by listing them with trade paperbacks. The Fantasy Collection and The Premium Specialty Collection are two vendor catalogs which use the headings "Trade Paperback" and "Hardcovers" to describe their graphic novels.[2] A closer look shows that they are created from the same database, the only difference being The Premium Specialty Collection is for dealers and contains discount and

---

[1] McCallum, Brenda. "Working definition", [memmo], Nov 16, 1987.

[2] The Fantasy Collection. [Catalog] Capital city distribution, May 1990. 74.

The Premium Specialty Collection. [Catalog] Capital city distribution, October 1990. 74.

ordering information. The Fantasy Collection is aimed at the individual buyer and has no discount information.

Catalogs are also issued by publishers of graphic novels. An example is Eclipse Books. The back of their 1989 catalog says, "Eclipse Books has been publishing graphic novels for more than ten years and remains the innovator in content, design, and packaging."[1] Examples of Eclipse's publishing in BGSUs list are titles #016, 073, 085, 104, 150, and 126. On the verso of the title page of Classic DC Graphic Novels Catalog (put out by DC Comics) has "This Classic DC Graphic Novels catalog represents DC's crowning achievements in the comic art form. The following new and original graphic novels and trade paperback collections, reprinting rare Golden Age and contemporary stories, have been appreciated by readers for years."[2] Examples of DC's publishing in BGSUs list are titles 008, 020, 112, 113, 122, 131, and 163.

In the definitions, the use of the term "novel" implies visual formats that are not considered graphic novels. Bound collections of newspaper strips, such as Calvin and Hobbs, Ziggy, Peanuts,etc. do not follow the common definition of a novel -- that it has a beginning, middle and end. Collected strips usually only tell an ongoing story at best. Other compiled strips, such as Prince Valiant or Little Orphan Annie might be considered graphic novels as their compilations tell a

---

1. Eclipse Books [Catalog], Catalogue design by Larry Marder, 1989. [16]

2. Classic DC Graphic Novels Catalog, Diamond Comic Distributors, 1989. [12]

complete story.

This ambiguity could lead to a bias against considering any bound collection of newspaper strips, a graphic novel. This bias could extend to compilations from a magazine or bound mini-series. Many of the titles used in this study have a prior history in another form; some examples are titles # 46, 58, 96, 112, 181.

Anthologies on the whole are another format that do not fit the definition of a novel. Collections are not considered novels even if they are linked by a common theme or story. An exception is made if the reviewer, cataloger or reader is not aware of the prior history of the anthology. Science fiction uses the term **fix-up** which is "a book made up of stories originally published separately, but altered to fit together... they are usually marketed as novels."[1]

---

[1]. Nicholls, Peter, ed. The Science Fiction Encyclopedia, 9.

B. Bibliographic Control

There are major problems in conducting a literature review of graphic novels. One is that the term "graphic novel" is still evolving, and graphic novels are confused with comic books and other graphic art. Another problem is that much of the literature and discussion about the form, occur in material to which the researcher or librarian has limited access, such as the alternative press. The exclusiveness as well as lack of access to "comic" publications will probably lead to mainstream writings, opinions and definitions being accepted as the standard. This paper, for the most part, looks at sources available in mainstream publishing.

Most librarians prefer to order material after reading reviews or looking at the material itself; others use approval plans. Approval plans demand a definition for the material that the vendor and the librarian agree on. Publishers Weekly is the only mainstream tool that constantly reviews graphic novels. Keith DeCandido's 1990 article in Library Journal is one of the few treatments of graphic novels in library related literature.[1]

DeCandido lists three major serial sources for critical discussion of graphic novels: The Comics Journal, The Comics Buyer's Guide, and Amazing Heroes.[2] From a librarian's

---

[1]. DeCandido, Keith R. A. "Picture This: Graphic Novels in Libraries." Library Journal March 15, 1990: 50-55.

[2]. ibid., 51.

standpoint, they are not good sources as they have no indexes. Furthermore, access to them is limited for according to OCLC cataloging records, The Comics Journal is only held in eighteen locations, The Comics Buyer's Guide in seven and Amazing Heroes in four.[1] The holding's record makes it obvious that the three magazines are not used often by librarians. And though DeCandido "...reviews comics and graphic novels for The Comics Journal", these reviews do not appear on most reviewing indexes.[2]

There are no conprehensive indexes for graphic novels, comics, or comic-related art. In order to deal with this, special libraries such as The Cartoon, Graphic, and Photographic Arts Research Library at Ohio State University or the Russel B. Nye Popular Culture Collection at Michigan State University keep vertical files.

Another source of information is the graphic novel itself. Many have forewards and other information in the preface or colophon of the book. Mention is often made of other graphic novels by the same publishers and/or authors.

Many graphic novels remain in print or are reprinted; therefore, a librarian can usually preview a graphic novel at a local comic or book store before purchasing. Most book

---

[1]Amazing Heroes. Stamford, CT: Zam, OCLC #7616065.

The Comics Buyer's Guide. Iola, WI: Krause Publications, OCLC #9185196.

The Comics Journal. Bethel, CT: The Comics Journal, OCLC #4521305.

[2]DeCandido, 50.

stores have some graphic novels; Waldenbooks, for example, has labeled racks.

Of special interest to the librarian is Robert Overstreet's annual bible for comic book collectors since many graphic novels began as a serial or multi-volume works (comic book mini-series).[1] Overstreet usually will indicate if a graphic novel or trade paperback has been published for a comic. A limitation, however, is that he does not always show if the graphic novel is a reprint.

A good example of a graphic novel reprint is Watchmen.[2] It first appeared as a DC comics twelve issue mini-series. A collector would pay over $40.00 to get all twelve ,out-of-print, issues from a comic book store. The graphic novel, a reprint of all issues, costs $16.95. Watchmen is not on BGSUs list of titles, probably because it was cataloged before the subject heading "graphic novels" was assigned.

Another source of listings is the publishers series such as First Comics Graphic Novel, DC Graphic Novel and Marvel Graphic Novel. If a work is in a series, good cataloging should include

---

[1]Overstreet, Robert M. Official Overstreet Comic Book Price Guide. 18th ed. New York: House of Collectibles, 1988.

[2]Moore, Alan & Dave Gibbons ill. & letterer, John Higgins colorist. Watchmen. New York: DC Comics, 1986. OCLC # 15063233.

_____. Watchmen. New York: DC Comics, 1987. OCLC #17257135.

_____. Watchmen. New York: DC Comics, 1987. OCLC #18203911.

_____. Watchmen. New York: Warner books, 1987. OCLC #17301724.

series added entries. Randall Scott, a cataloger at Michigan State University, specializes in comic books and other related art. He wrote the chapter "Cataloging Comics" in Cataloging Special Materials.[1] Scott traces series in his cataloging on OCLC.

There are dissertations directly relating to the graphic novel, but they do not relate to cataloging. Two of them are "Reinventing the Wheel" and "L'aventure D'une Ecriture".[2] "Reinventing the Wheel" is a master's thesis relating to the graphic novel, Watchmen. "L'aventure D'une Ecriture" is about "bandes dessinees" or "B.D's", a Belgian/European term for comic art and graphic novels. The abstract to "L'aventure D'une Ecriture" provides yet another definition of graphic novels, "... a theatre of writing where a contagion between writing, graphics, literature, painting and theatre occurs."[3]

Almost every article dealing with graphic novels cites their popularity in Europe or Asia, but offers little concrete information to confirm the fact. Two exceptions are articles by

---

[1]Scott, Randall. " Cataloging Comics." in Cataloging Special Materials: Critiques and Innovations, ed. Sanford Berman, 50-70: Oryx Press, 1986.

[2]Fauvel, Marie-Louise. "L'Aventure D'Une Ecriture: La Bande Dessinee D'essai." (Ph.D. diss., University of Wisconson, 1989) [French Text] 200, Dialog, Dissertation Abstracts International, #01100712.

Holman, Curtis Lehner. "Reinventing the Wheel: A Multi-Perspective Analysis of Alan Moore and Dave Gibbon's Graphic Novel 'Watchmen'." (M.A. diss., University of Georgia, 1989), Dialog, Dissertation Abstracts International, #01099187.

[3]Fauvel, ibid.

Roger Du Mars and Anne Devreux.[1] Du Mars lists some of the translated graphic novels and says that "...Japanese readers purchased more than 1.5 billion graphic novels in 1986."[2] The Devreux article deals with the history and popularity of Belgian bandes dessinees (graphic novels). In 1983, 28.7% of the Belgian book industry consisted of graphic novels. In 1985 the percentage had gone to 32.7% constituting 52 million dollars.[3] Devreux lists some graphic novels on BGSUs list such as Titles #72 and 76. Examples from the Du Mars article are Titles #22, 112, 143, 144, and 162.

---

[1]Devreux, Anne Shapiro. "Biff Wham Bam!: Call it Bandes Dessinee or Graphic Novel, it's the Newest Belgian Winner!" Belgian American Trade Review [Vertical file, Ohio State University]: 18-21.

Du Mars, Roger Dean. "The Comic Book Grows Up, Graphic Novels: Not Just Kid Stuff." Christian Science Monitor December 28, 1988:[Vertical file, Ohio State University]

[2]Du Mars.

[3]Devreux, 18.

C. Cataloging Questions

1) Format

To a librarian, a major difference between a comic book and a graphic novel is that the graphic novel (in trade paperback or hardcover form) can withstand more circulations. Libraries that carry comic books do not always catalog them, because comic books are not built to withstand the forces generated by cataloging, yet alone patron use. Graphic novels, on the other hand, can withstand the normal wear and care that most library materials undergo.

The newness of the format in this country stretches the existing cataloging rules and conventions. There are very few catalogers dealing with the form in this country. One of them is Randall Scott at Michigan State University Library. Sanford Berman described Scott as "... the foremost library authority and advocate for ... comic books... as well as producing the basic tools and guides for both collecting and organizing comic book collections. In this otherwise neglected but significant field, he has no peer."[1]

Scott uses AACR2 conventions and rules. He tries to extend and modify them in a logical and systematic manner. His recent book, Comics Librarianship: a handbook, is an invaluable source in interpreting the data for this masters paper.[2] The Ohio

---

[1]Scott, Randall. Comics Librarianship: a handbook. Jefferson, North Carolina: McFarland, 1990.

2.ibid.

State University's "Cartoon, Graphic and Photographic Arts Research Library" uses a Scott article as a reference source.[1]

2) Access Points

Who is the Main Entry and how many Added Entries to list poses a problem with graphic novels for a graphic novel can have more than eighteen individuals playing different roles.[2] Some of the roles found in graphic novels are Pencilers, Inkers, Letterers, Creators, Adapters, Visual Effects Specialists, Colorists, Illustrators, Writers, Editors, Authors, Painters, Calligraphers, Translators, Cover Artists, and so forth. The publishers often have their own statement of responsibility: Presidents, Design Directors, Managing Editors, Production Directors, Editors, Co-Editors, Controllers, and so on. Sometimes there are layers of editors, with separate ones for the publisher and for the graphic novel. Michigan State University "...classifies by the first name on the title page, when a graphic novel is presented as by an artist/writer or a writer/artist team".[3]

This plethora of roles can lead to the use of a title main entry. Graphic novels that adopt a comic book format can cause confusion for comic books often have a changing cover title while keeping a constant indica title. Comic book bibliographies such

---

[1]Scott, Randall. "Cataloging Comics." ibid.

[2]Miller, Frank. Batman : The Dark Knight Returns New York, NY : Warner Books, 1986. ISBN 0-446-38505-0 NOTE: This is Title 112.

[3]Scott, Comics Librarianship, 76-77.

as Overstreet use the indica title as a main entry. AACR2rev in rule 12.0B1, uses the title page as chief source of information. This leads to a single comic having several different titles.[1] A 1986 rule interpretation allows the use of a "stable" title.[2]

3) Classification

A preliminary look at the classification numbers indicates that graphic novels and comics are often classified together. Dewey has most in the 741's (Drawing & Drawings). Library of Congress (LC) often classifies them in PN6700's (Comic Books, Strips, etc.).[3] PN6700 contains material about comics, anthologies, works about illustration, newspaper strip reprints, how to draw comics, etc. Graphic novels, obviously are an "etc.".

Bodian lists two sizes for graphic novels: 7"x10" and 8 1/2"x11".[4] These are the standard sizes for comic books and magazines respectively. Graphic novels thus fit the standard shelves in comic book stores but not most library fiction shelves. This size difference might be the basis for the

---

1. Scott, Randall. Comics Librarianship, 63-66.
NOTE: Randall uses the example of the comic book Scout which has been compiled into graphic novels Scout: Mount Fire & Scout: The Four Monsters.

2. LCRI Cumulated 12.0b1:CSB34.

3. Scott, Comics Librarianship, 77.

4. Bodian, ibid.

preference of using PN6700's as the shelves are usually taller.

Scott, at Michigan State University, has the advantage of an archival research library which allows a certain flexibility in classification numbers. His preference is to list comic books by title.[1] "The MSU call number system differs from the LC schedule mainly in its treatment of United States comic books. Grouping is by decade in which a serial begins, with subgrouping by publisher."[2]

4) Illustration

The graphic novel can not exist without illustration which is one of the main differences between it and a conventional novel. The graphic novel's illustration also tells a sequential story. AACR2 makes no distinction between illustrations that are an accessory to the story and illustrations that are vital. AACR2 in section 2.5c. Illustrative matter uses terms such as **ill., all ill., chiefly ill., col. ill., ill. (some col.)**. The preference would be to use **chiefly ill.** for graphic novels. A Library of Congress memorandum states "Describe an illustrated printed monograph as **ill** in all cases..."[3] Catalogers following this memorandum will have a serious information loss. Fortunately the rule interpretation allows other libraries to use fuller forms of **ill.**

---

[1]. ibid, 70.

[2]. ibid, 73.

[3]. Cataloging Service Bulletin, No. 47(Winter 1990), 30.

5) Seriality

Graphic novels may start as a serialization, either as part of an ongoing comic book or a separately published mini-series, thus cataloging records may exist for both series and the graphic novel. Cataloging records on OCLC, however, do not always show if the graphic novel originally was serialized as a comic book. Watchmen, for example, started out as a twelve issue mini-series, yet two of the OCLC records do not mention this.[1] The other two records have "Originally published in 12 issues, magazine form, 1986-1987." and "'Originally published by DC Comics Inc. in twelve issues in magazine form, 1986-1987"--T.p. verso."[2] Another example is the graphic novel Maus, title # 162 of this study. On the verso of the title page:

> Chapters 1 through 6 first appeared, in somewhat different form, in Raw magazine between 1980 and 1985. "Prisoner on the Hell Planet" originally appeared in Short Order Comix #1, 1973.[3]

None of the Maus, OCLC records show this information.

---

[1]Moore, Alan & Dave Gibbons ill. & letterer, John Higgins colorist. Watchmen. New York: DC Comics, 1986. OCLC # 15063233.

_____. Watchmen. New York: DC Comics, 1987. OCLC #17257135.

[2]_____. Watchmen. New York: DC Comics, 1987. OCLC # 18203911.

_____. Watchmen. New York: Warner books, 1987. OCLC #17301724.

[3]Spiegelman, Art. Maus: A Survivor's Tale. New York: Pantheon Books, 1986. OCLC #13524314.

METHODOLOGY

The hypothesis is that as a new format, graphic novels will suffer from inconsistent cataloging. Some of the inconsistencies might be in classification, subject analysis, added entries, physical description, and so on.

Since November 1987, Bowling Green State University's "Popular Culture Library", uses the term "Graphic Novels" as a locally assigned subject heading in cataloging. The catalogers have used a single definition of graphic novels.[1]

These bibliographic records, from the Bowling Green State University's online catalog in October 1990, make up the graphic novels titles used in this study. The titles from BGSU will be searched in OCLC with the expectation that some titles will have multiple records. All existing records on OCLC for each title will be downloaded and encoded for statistical analysis. The statistical package, SPSS, will be used to analyze the data. In this way, inconsistency, ambiguity and similarity in the cataloging of graphic novels can be quantified.

The following data was extracted and encoded from the OCLC records:

1) Accession Number: The number given to each unique OCLC record.

2) Title Number: The number given to each title used.

---

[1]. Exerpts are reprinted in the section, A. Definitions of the Graphic Novel, of this masters paper.

OCLC FIXED FORMAT:

3) OCLC Number: The OCLC number is listed but not analyzed. It will facilitate checking data.

4) Entrd: The year the graphic novel was cataloged on OCLC. This is system supplied. The assumption is that most graphic novels will be cataloged on OCLC.

5) M/F/B: The **F** allows the cataloger to indicate if the work is fiction or non fiction. This is optional cataloging.

6) Int lvl: The cataloger can indicate if the work is a juvenile work (through age 16). This is optional cataloging. One constant in the definitions of graphic novels is that they are not children's works. The assumption is that a **j** would be rare in cataloging.

OCLC FIXED TAGS

7) 300 ill: A graphic novel is chiefly illustration. The cataloging record should indicate this.

8) 040/Translation: If graphic novels have a longer history outside the USA, then it is likely that many American graphic novels would be translated from other countries.

9) 050/090/Classification Number **LC**: The LC call number, up to the first decimal point, will be noted. This will be the only Alpha-numeric record. All other records are numeric.

10) 080/082/092/Classification Number **DEWEY**: The first three digits of the Dewey number, up to the decimal point, will be noted. The term graphic novel implies that they are novels, therefore they should have a call number that reflects that

11) 5xx/Other Form: Graphic novels can start life serialized in a comic book, adapted from a novel or appearing in another form.

Questions 12-14) Does the phrase "graphic novel(s)" appear in the OCLC cataloging record?

12) 245/Title: Is the term part of the title?

13) 5xx/Note: Is the term in the Notes field?

14) 4xx/Series: Is the term part of a series name?

Questions 15-16) The Subject Headings given a work reflect the perceived nature of the item. The assumption at this point is that the cataloger will focus on the visual aspect of the graphic novels and that the subject headings will reflect this.

15) 65x/69x Number: The number of subject headings.

16) 65x/69x Not-graphic: The number of subject headings from question 15 that do not reflect the visual nature of the work. (i.e. do not have Comic books, strips, etc.).

Questions 17-19) A look at almost any graphic novel indicates that there can be many people responsible for the work. The question of how many are listed and subsequently traced is important.

17) Total number of people responsible: This will be taken from the **100, 245, 500 tags.**

18) Total number of people traced: How many are traced in the added entries and main entry.

19) Is role of everybody indicated:

Questions 20-26) Cataloging rules state which names deserve added entries. The plethora of names in graphic novels might lead to cataloging shortcuts, especially since some of the roles associated with the names do not appear in cataloging rule books. Questions 20-26 look at names listed in the **245, 500, etc** field in the OCLC record that were not given added entries.

20) Original Author not traced:

21) Writer/Adapter not traced:

22) Colorist/Illustrator/Painter/Artist not traced:

23) Calligrapher/Letterer not traced:

24) Editor not traced:

25) Translator not traced:

26) Other's not traced:

27) Number of Holdings: A large number of holdings for graphic novels could indicate that libraries are buying and cataloging them.

MASTER'S RESEARCH PAPER: CODING FORM

OCLC CODING: BOOKS FORMAT

1) Accession Number: __,__,__
2) Title Number: __,__,__

OCLC FIXED FORMAT

3) OCLC: __,__,__,__,__,__,__,__ (OCLC Number)
4) Entrd: __,__ (first 2 digits= year)
5) M/F/B: __ (F only, 2nd pos. not/Fic=0,Fic=1)
6) Int lvl: __ ([]=0,j=1)

OCLC TAGS

7) 300 ill: __ ([]=0,ill=1,chiefly/mostly/totally ill=2,etc.=3)
8) Translation: __ (all sources not-trans=0,trans=1)
9) 050/090: __,__ __,__,__,__ (050 priority PN21.5=P,N,0,0,2,1)
10) 080/082/092: __,__,__ (082 priority 73.215=0,7,3)

(Originally pub. in other form/serialized/adapted, etc.)
11) 5xx Other form: __ (all sources no=0,yes=1)

("Graphic Novel(s)" mentioned)
12) 245/Title: __ (245 tag, only no=0,yes=1)
13) 5xx Note: __ (5xx tags, only no=0,yes=1)
14) 4xx Series: __ (4xx tags, only no=0,yes=1)

15) 65x/69x Number: __,__ (Topical Subject Headings)
16) 65x/69x Not-graphic: __,__ (# not reflecting graphic nature ie. "comic books, strips, etc.")

17) Total number of people responsible:
__,__ (100,245,500 tags)
18) Total number of people traced:
__,__

19) Is role of everybody indicated: __ (no=0,yes=1)

(#20-26 refer only to people in #17)
20) Original Author not traced: __ (no=0,yes=1)
21) Writer/Adapter not traced: __ (no=0,yes=1)
22) Colorist/illustrator/painter/artist not traced: __ (no=0,yes=1)
23) Calligrapher/Letterer not traced: __ (no=0,yes=1)
24) Editor not traced: __ (no=0,yes=1)
25) Translator not traced: __ (no=0,yes=1)
26) Other's not traced: __ (no=0,yes=1)

27) Number of holdings: __,__,__

NOTES/QUESTIONS

TABLE 1 Number of OCLC Records per Title								
Number of OCLC Records Per Title	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	11
Number of Titles	132	39	11	2	2	1	3	1
% of total titles	69.1%	20.4%	5.8%	1%	1%	0.5%	1.6%	0.5%

The Mean is for 1.502 OCLC records per title.
The Standard Deviation is 1.243.

TITLE #54 has 11 OCLC records.
TITLE #2, 143, 181 has 7 OCLC records.
TITLE #135 has 6 OCLC records.
TITLE #58, 112 has 5 OCLC records.
TITLE #80, 162 has 4 OCLC records.
TITLE #15,20,24,25,50,59,77,83,144,172,174 has 3 OCLC records.

Most of the titles only have one OCLC record. Multiple records should occur only if there are significant differences between the old record and the new material to be cataloged. Title #54, A Contract With God by Will Eisner, has 11 OCLC records. They represent cataloging done by four different libraries including DLC. OSU created eight different OCLC records for eight foreign language editions; Swedish, Danish, German, French, Finish, Yiddish, Italian and Spanish. Eisner is traced but, none of the translators, even when the translators are mentioned in the statement of responsibility.[1] The other three records are for different publishers or copyright dates. In total, there are 38 holding records for the 11 OCLC records.

Thieves world started as a fantasy anthology in which

[1]. AACR2 does not usually trace translators, see TABLE 6.

different authors write about the same town. This multi-volume series proved to be so popular that it also has been published in multi-volume graphic novel form. Title #2 is for Thieves World Graphics which has seven OCLC records. Five of the OCLC records are by DLC. Two of the records treat Thieves World Graphics as multi-volume work, four records are for single volume works, and one record treats them as a serial. Three records classify them in PN6727(Comic books, by author)/741, two records do not classify them(do not use LC format), one record puts them in PS3551(Literature, by author)/813 and one record in PN6726(Comic books, by collections). OCLC lists 47 holdings.

Another graphic novel with seven holdings is Title #143, Corto Maltese by Hugo Pratt. This is one of the few graphic novels that is completely done by one person. The graphic novels are made up of collected stories about Corto Maltese. The records are for works in Italian, French and English. Three records classify them in PN6768(Comic books, Italy, by Title), one in PN6767(Comic books, Italy by Author) and one in PN6748(Comic books, France, by Title). OCLC lists 47 holdings.

The last graphic novel with seven OCLC records is Title #181, Early days of the Southern Knights. The Southern Knights is a comic book whose issues have been compiled into trade paperbacks. Early Days of the Southern Knights, Volume two, has on the back "...this graphic novel is just what you need..."[1] Volume 3 drops the term graphic novel and uses graphic album

---

[1]. Vogel, Henry Early Days of the Southern Knights, Vol. 2, New Yor, New York: Comics Interview. 1986.

instead. There is a separate OCLC record for each volume. All of the classification numbers are for PN6728(Comic books, by title).

Title #135, Elfquest has six OCLC records. Elfquest's popularity caused it to be reprinted as a color comic. There are also Elfquest mini-series. The comics and mini-series were then reprinted as graphic novels. Later on, these graphic novels were reprinted with enhanced color as The Complete Elfquest. Since The Complete Elfquest does not indicate which Elfquest graphic novels it reprints, it was not included in the analysis of graphic novel titles. DLC treats it as a multi-volume work with classification number PS3566(American literature, individual authors)/813(Literature, American). The only other classification number given is PN6728. There are 207 holdings on OCLC for this title.

The examples of graphic novels with multiple records indicates that there is considerable flexibility in the cataloging. This could be caused by different interpretations of the AACR2 cataloging rules by different libraries, or a sense of confusion on the material being catalogued.

TABLE 2 The year entered in OCLC		
Year entered on OCLC	Number of Records	Percent
1976	1	0.3%
1977	1	0.3%
1978	3	1.0%
1979	6	2.0%
1980	6	2.0%
1981	3	1.0%
1982	3	1.0%
1983	4	1.3%
1984	27	9.0%
1985	25	8.4%
1986	30	10.0%
1987	42	14.0%
1988	48	16.1%
1989	65	21.7%
1990	35	11.7%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

This table is interesting, but not very valid for the following reasons. First, it reflects BGSU's adoption of a locally defined subject heading of "graphic novels" in late 1985. The expected conclusion is that there would be more graphic novels cataloged in a subject heading after the subject heading was adopted. The second reason is that there was no retrospective conversion to give previously cataloged graphic novels the subject heading "graphic novels". The last reason is that BGSU has a budget, which constrains purchasing.

The graphic novels cataloged before the 1980's indicate some

of the earlier titles. The earliest record is title #77[record #248], Ulysses, entered in 1976. The other two records for this title were entered in 1979 and 1988. The 1976 record is for the English translation from the French original. The more recent records are for French reprints of the graphic novel. All records have the classification number PN6747(Comic books, France, by author), with one having Homer as Main Entry and another having the adapter as Main Entry.

Barbarella was originally a comic strip in a magazine during 1962. The strips were then collected to form the graphic novel. The movie starring Jane Fonda was based on the graphic novel. The other entries were cataloged in 1983, 1986, 1988 and 1989. Title #58[record #181], Barbarella, was cataloged in 1977. Three entries are in French, two in English. There are two DLC records. Three records, including DLC, have a classification number of NC1499(Fine arts, Drawing, Pictorial humor, France, by author). The other numbers are NC1599(Fine arts, Drawing, Pictorial humor, Denmark, by author) and PN6748(Literature, collections, comic books, France, by title).

TABLE 3 The form of **ill.** in OCLC		
	Number of Records	Percent
no ill.	7	2.3%
ill., color ill.	240	80.3%
totally ill. mostly ill. chiefly ill.	52	17.4%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

OCLC records with no entry for **ill.** are:

Title #2[005,007,286], Title #15[019], Title #58[180], Title #143[259] and Title #179[156].

This data was taken from the OCLC 300 Physical Description field. Germane AACR2 rules are 2.5C1 and 2.5C6.

Using the cataloging term **ill.** or **color ill.** reduces the status of the artwork of a graphic novel to a mere addendum. The term **chiefly ill.**[1] is a more accurate reflection of the ratio of text to illustration that exists.

A convention of graphic novel cataloging should be the use of the term **chiefly ill.**. Table #3 indicates that this is not how they are cataloged. There are two main places in an OCLC record where information on the illustration level can be obtained. The first is in the OCLC Fixed Field illus:. This is intended to reflect and expand on the 300 field. Illus: reveals

---

[1] **chiefly ill.** is preffered by AACR2 even though **mostly ill.** and **totally ill** are also used by some member libraries.

the form but not the quantity of the illustration. The only two codes applicable to graphic novels are **a**[illustrations] or **[]**[no illustrations]. This is optional cataloging with **[]** also used as the default.

The OCLC 300 Physical Description filed, Subfield **b** is where AACR2 rules 2.5C1 and 2.5C6 apply. This is not optional cataloging. Therefore, the seven records with no coding for **ill.** were a surprise. Record #156 has no 300 field but did code illus: **a**. Record #180 has a 300 field, no **ill.**, but did have a subject heading of "French Wit and Humor, Pictorial". Records #19 and #259 have **Enc lvl:** of **K** which indicates that the catalogers believed that they were cataloging at the Less-than-full level. Records #5,7 and 286 belong to the "Thieves Worlds" anthologies and are DLC records. Record #5 has **Enc lvl: J** which indicates that the record has been deleted. Record #7 has **Enc lvl: 8** which is Pre-Publication-level cataloging. Record #286 is a serial record with no **Enc lvl:** field. The 580 field has "Graphic novels based on ...". The presence of this note indicates an effort made to clarify the form of the record.

There are 52 OCLC records that have **chiefly ill.**,**mostly ill.**, or **totally ill.** DLC has cataloged 24 of these records. The most records were cataloged in 1988 with 14 entries. 24 of the records have a Dewey number and 43 have a LC number. 23 records have one or more subject headings. There are 848 holdings for the 52 records.

The presence of **chiefly ill.** implies that the artwork is a major factor in the graphic novel. There are, however, six

records that have an artist in the statement of responsibility, but no added entry for the artist.

These are;

Title 2[rec 4,6]Thieves' world graphics
Title 53[rec 51]Teenage mutant ninja turtles
Title 108[rec 93]Les oiseaux du maitre
Title 164[rec 138]Batman: the cult
Title 168[rec 251]Incredible Hulk and the Thing...

Title 2[rec 4,6], Thieves' World Graphics was first discussed with Table 1. Record 4 has in the statement of responsibility; "adapted by Robert Asprin and Lynn Abbey ; art by Tim Sale". Sale is not traced. Record 6 has the same entries for the statement of responsibility and Sale is not traced. Record 2,3,5,7 cataloged by DLC for the same title, trace Sale. A look at Thieves' world graphics has Sale clearly listed by role, on the cover, title page and CIP.

Title 53[rec 51], Teenage mutant ninja turtles has in the statement or responsibility; "Kevin Eastman and Peter Laird" who are traced. In the OCLC 500 field, "Steve Lavigne, letterer ; Kevin Eastman, Ken Feduniewicz, Janice Cohen, colorists". Lavigne, Feduniewicz and Cohen were not traced. This is the colorized reprinting of the first three issues of the original black and white comic book which has since been made into two movies, animated cartoons and other spin offs.

Title 108[rec 93], Les Oiseaux du Maitre, has in the statement of responsibility; **[dessins] par...** and **couleur.** The **[dessins] par** is traced, but the **couleur** is not. Record 94 for the same title has only **col. ill.** and the **couleur** is not traced.

Title 164[rec 138], Batman: the cult cataloged by DLC, has

in the statement of responsibility; "Jim Starlin, writer ; Berni Wrightson, illustrator ; Bill Wray, color artist ; Todd Klein, letterer". The OCLC 500 field has "Created by Bob Kane". Wray and Klein are not traced. Record 137 for the same title has in the statement of responsibility "Jim Starlin, writer ; Berni Wrightson, illustrator ; Bill Wray, color artist". All are traced.

Title 168[rec 251], Incredible Hulk and the Thing..., has in the statement of responsibility; "story by Jim Starlin ; art by Berni Wrightson ; Jim Novak, letterer ; Carl Potts, titles designer ; Allen Milgrom, editor". The OCLC 490 field has "Stan Lee presents...". Starlin and Wrightson are the only two traced.

The recommendation is that **chiefly ill.** should be used in the physical description field.

TABLE 4 The value of **F** in **M/F/B**			
	Value of **F**	Number of Records	Percent
[*serial rec*]	.	6	2.0%
Not fiction	0	104	34.8%
Fiction	1	189	63.2%

serial records do not have an **M/F/B** field.

This data is from the **F** in the OCLC Fixed Fields Format **M/F/B**. This represents optional cataloging with **0** as the default. The **F** stands for the fiction code. The choices are fiction **1** or non-fiction **0**. Drama is not considered fiction by OCLC and should be coded **0**. A cataloger must deliberately code **1** for fiction.

Novels are usually considered fiction. Graphic novels should then be considered mostly fiction also. Only a few of the graphic novel titles in this study could be considered non-fiction. Two of these are Title #16 and #162. Title #16 is Brought to Light which deals with undercover actions by the USA government in South America. The classification number in both records is for F1436. Record #20, by DLC, has six Subject Added entries and 64 holding records. Record #21 is for the British publication of the same work. Both records have **0** for **F**.

Title #162 is Maus; a survivor's tale by Spiegelman. This is a grim retelling of Spiegelman's parents experiences as Jews during WWII. Classification numbers are PS3569 and DU810 for LC and 741 and 940 for DEWEY. **ill:** is 2 for all entries and there is a total of 648 holding records. The **F** in **M/F/B** is coded 0 for

all four records.

Fiction works are not usually given Dewey classification numbers unless they are in the 800's(Literature & rhetoric). There are only 12 Dewey records with a classification number having a **F** code of **1**. These are:

Title 2[rec 3]	Dewey is 741	Thieves world
Title 2[rec 5]	Dewey is 813	Thieves world
Title 4[rec 9]	Dewey is 741	Through the looking .
Title 6[rec 237]	Dewey is 741	Robotech
Title 68[rec 281]	Dewey is 741	Hamlet
Title 112[rec 201]	Dewey is 741	Batman: Dark Knight
Title 185[rec 234]	Dewey is 741	Lightrunner
Title 133[rec 117]	Dewey is 813	Love shots
Title 135[rec 295]	Dewey is 813	Elfquest
Title 148[rec 125]	Dewey is 813	Silver metal lover
Title 61[rec 278]	Dewey is 823	Great expectations
Title 30[rec 298]	Dewey is 843	Hunting party[1]

Another point to look at is the use of subject headings. Works of fiction traditionally do not have many subject headings; most have none. A look at Table 11B allows a comparison of the fiction label and subject headings. There are 172 subject headings for all 299 records. There are 75 subject headings for the 189 records coded for fiction. This seems to confirm that works considered fiction recieve fewer subject headings.

More use of the fiction code **F** leads to a fuller cataloging record. This is not, however, mandatory cataloging.

---

1. SEE Table 8A to compare this against regular Dewey numbers.

TABLE 5 Intellectual Level: **Int lvl**		
Int lvl value	Number of Records	Percent
0	287	96%
j	12	4%

The OCLC fixed field code **Int lvl** is optional cataloging for the intellectual level of the work. A **j** indicates a belief that the work is intended for juveniles through age 16. The default as well as a non-juvenile work is **0**. The 12 records coded **j** are:

Title 4 : Through the looking glass
Title 24[rec 24] : Yankee named Blueberry
Title 50[rec 46] : Willow; the official...
Title 107[rec 92] : Heroes of the equinox
Title 109 : World without stars
Title 153 : Enchanted apples of Oz
Title 87 : The hunger dogs
Title 136 : The adventures of Tom Sawyer
Title 161 : Dr. Jeckel & Mr. Hyde
Title 67 : Count of Monte Cristo
Title 95 : Call of the wild
Title 135[rec 295]: Elfquest

There are other ways to determine if a work is considered juvenile. The presence of a 520 field is rare in fiction cataloging, with the exception of childrens material.[1] This is often seen with the 650 field having a second indicator value of **1**.[2] There are seven records with a 520 field. Seven records also have a 650 field, with five of those records having a **1** in

---

[1]. The 520 field **Summary, Abstract, or Annotation Note** is optional cataloging.

[2]. A **1** in the second indicator value of the 6xx field **Subject Added Entries** stands for **LC Subject Heading for Children's Literature, or Annotated Card Program (AC).**

the second indicator. Only six records have the 520 field and a 650 field together. This leads to a conclusion that the OCLC j code and the Library of Congress's Annotated Card Program are not closely linked by catalogers for graphic novels.

The fact that only twelve records were coded j indicates that graphic novels are not automatically treated as juvenile works by the catalogers.

TABLE 6 Translated		
	Number of Records	Percent
YES	73	24.4%
NO	226	75.6%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

Other countries and cultures have been creating graphic novels longer than the U.S.A. Popular and successful graphic novels in one county usually are considered prime candidates for publication in another. It, therefore it should not be surprising that a number of graphic novels in this country are translations. The cataloging records, unfortunately, do not always note this.

Table 6 was constructed by using the cataloging records, the actual graphic novel, discussions with comic book dealers, and references in texts.[1] Therefore consider that at least 24.4% of the records were translated.

AACR2 allows the translator to be listed in the statement of responsibility, but often consider added entries to be superfluous.[2] A contract with God by Will Eisner is a good example..[3] The OCLC 041 **Languages** field is required cataloging.

---

[1]·Table 9 was formed the same way.

[2]·AACR2 rule 21.30K **Translators**. Note that graphic novels do not fit many of the conditions necessary for translator added entries.

[3]·This is discussed with TABLE 1.

An indicator of 1 indicates that the work is a translation or includes a translation.

Classification numbers for translations normally follow the original text, but this is true only if the cataloger knows the work is a translation, and knows in what language/country the work was originally published. A look at Table 7A and 7A1 shows some flexibility with this practice.

Michigan State University shelves "comic book which are or may be translations, with the publications of the country in which they are published."[1] This allows translations of Batman graphic novels to be classified by language,but "Collections of comic strips in book form, even if they are translated, are shelved with the language they originated with...".[2] Books are felt to be less ambiguous.

---

1. Scott, Comics Librarianship, 86.

2. ibid.

TABLE 7A LC number		
LC number	Number of Records	Percent
no number	43	14.4%
D 810	1	0.3%
F1436	2	.7%
NC1499	4	1.3%
NC1599	1	.3%
PN1997	1	.3%
PN6725-6728	154	51.1%
PN6737	3	1.0%
PN6745-6748	36	12.0%
PN6765-6768	10	3.3%
PN6775-6778	2	.7%
PN6790	10	3.3%
PQ 1-3999	7	2.1%
PQ4876	1	.3%
PQ7798	1	.3%
PR 1-9680	5	1.7%
PS 1-3576	16	7.0%
PT2673	1	.3%
PZ 10	1	.3%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

TABLE 7A1 LC number if known translation		
LC number	Number of Records	Percent
no number	11	15.1%
NC1499	1	1.4%
NC1599	1	1.4%
PN1997	1	1.4%
PN6725-6728	11	15.0%
PN6737	2	2.7%
PN6745-6748	24	32.8%
PN6765-6768	7	9.6%
PN6775-6778	2	2.8%
PN6790	6	8.2%
PQ 1-3999	3	4.2%
PQ7798	1	1.4%
PS 1-3576	2	2.7%
PT2673	1	.3%
TOTAL	73	100.0%

TABLE 7B LC classification		
LC classification	Number of Records	Percent
no number	43	14.4%
History	1	0.3%
U.S.(local)	2	.7%
Fine Arts	5	1.7%
Drama	1	.3%
Comic Books	215	71.9%
Literature	31	10.4%
Juvenile	1	0.3%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

TABLE 7B1 LC classification (if fiction)		
LC classification	Number of Records	Percent
no number	20	10.6%
History	0	0.0%
U.S.(local)	0	0.0%
Fine Arts	2	1.1%
Drama	0	0.0%
Comic Books	138	73.0%
Literature	28	14.8%
Juvenile	1	0.5%
TOTAL	189	100.0%

Table 7B1 represents the LC classification for the **F** in the OCLC fixed field coded **1**, which represents fiction. See Table 4 for more information about **M/F/B**.

Library of Congress classification

D History: General and Old World
D 204-849 Modern history
D 731-838 World War II
D 810 TITLE #162[REC 195]

F United States(Local) and America except the United States
F 1421-1577 Central America
TITLE #16[REC 20,21]

N Fine Arts
NC Drawing. Design. Illustration
NC 1300-1766 Pictorial humor, caricature, etc.
NC 1490-1499 France
NC 1499 Special artists
TITLE #58[REC 180,181,183,] #59[REC 185]
NC 1590-1599 Denmark
NC 1599 Special artists
TITLE #58[REC 182]

PN 1-6790 LITERATURE (General)
PN 1600-3307 Drama
PN 1993-1999 Motion pictures
PN 1997-1997.85 Plays, scenarios, etc.
TITLE #189[REC 189]
PN 6010-6790 Collections of general literature
PN 6700-6790 Comic books, strips, etc.
PN 6725-6728 United States
PN 6726 Collections
PN 6727 Individual authors or works, A-Z
PN 6728 Individual comic strips. By title, A-Z.
PN 6735-6738 Great Britain
PN 6737 Individual authors or works, A-Z
PN 6745-6748 France
PN 6747 Individual authors or works, A-Z
PN 6748 Individual comic strips, By title, A-Z
PN 6765-6768 Italy
PN 6767 Individual authors or works, A-Z
PN 6768 Individual comic strips, By title, A-Z
PN 6775-6778 Spain
PN 6777 Individual authors or works, A-Z
PN 6778 Individual comic strips, By title, A-Z
PN 6790 Other regions or countries, A-Z

PQ 1-3999 French literature
PQ 1600-2651 Modern literature, Individual authors
PQ 2149-2551 19th century 1901-1960
PQ 2660-2686 1961- .A-Z
PQ 3801-3999 Provincial, local, colonial, etc.
PQ 4001-5991 Italian literature
PQ 4860-4886 Individual authors, 1961-
PQ 6001-8999 Spanish literature
PQ 7000-8921 Provincial, local, colonial, etc.

PQ 7020-8921 Ouside of Spain
PQ 7071-8560 America
PQ 7081-8560 Spanish America
PQ 7551-8549 South America
PQ 7600-7798 Argentine Republic
PQ 7798 Individual authors, 1961- .A-Z

PR 1-9680 English literature
PR 3991-5990 19th century, 1770/1800-1890/1900
PR 6050-6076 1961-

PS 1-3576 American literature
PS 700-3576 Individual authors
PS 700-3390 19th century
PS 3500-3549 1900-1960
PS 3550-3576 1961-

PT 1-4897 German literature
PT 1501-2688 Individual authors and works
PT 2660-2688 1961-
Title 100

PZ 1-90 Fiction and Juvenile belles lettres
PZ 5-90 Juvenile belles lettres
PZ 10 Science and industry
(PZ 10 no longer used.)
Title 95

Most of the graphic novels are classed in Literature (LC classification P) with 82.2% of the records. The percentage drops when comic books are separated from national literature. The majority of graphic novels are classed under "Comic books, strips, etc." with 71.9% of the records. There are several reasons for this. First of all, the illustrative nature of graphic novels makes it a simplistic choice. Secondly, the closest analogy to a graphic novel is "Comic books, strips, etc." Thirdly, the larger size of many graphic novels makes it hard to fit them in fiction shelves.

Title 162[rec 195], Maus is the only one to be classed as History in both LC classification(D 810) and Dewey(940). None of the other records for this title have LC classifications, but two

are classed in 741(Dewey) and one in 940(Dewey). A look at Table #16 shows that record 195 has 641 holdings, indicating not only the popularity of the title, but satisfaction with this cataloging record.

Title 58, Barbarella, has three records in Fine Arts and one record in Comic books. Another title by the same author is Title 59, Barbarella, the Moon Child. This has one record in Fine Arts and two records in Comic books. One record in Comic books is cuttered by title and another for the author. All records for both titles are in the classification for France. The exception is for Title 58, record 182, which has the work listed in Fine Arts under Denmark.

Since his inception, Batman has had numerous comic books, authors, writers, artists and graphic novels. Seven of the graphic novels are Titles 8, 112, 113, 122, 131, 163 and 164. The seven titles have 13 records. Seven Batman records have a Dewey number of 741. Eight Batman records have an LC classification number of PN6728, which is classed by title. In the PN6727-PN6728 range 105 records are classed by author and 48 records by title.

A look at Table 7A1 shows that most translations are not classed with U.S.A. comic books. The percentage drops from 51.1% in the general population to 15%. Classification for French comic books rises from 12% in the general population to 32.8%. Comparing Table 7B with Table 7B1 shows that about the same percentage of records are classed with comic books This shows that many catalogers consider the illustrations more important than the literature (fiction) aspect of graphic novels in

determining classification.

"Comic books, strips, etc." is too broad a heading for graphic novel classification. A search of the shelves under PN6727-PN6728 will not find graphic novels in one location, which is a disservice to the "novel" aspect of the works. The probability the Library of Congress will overhaul "Comic books, strips, etc." from a classification standpoint is not likely. Changing computer records is much easier and cheaper than retrospectively changing class numbers on the shelves.

The pattern is to allow a range of three for each countries classification for "Comic books, strips, etc.". This does not allow much hidden space for a new number for "graphic novels". Yet, without this, patrons will not be able to find them classed together on the shelf.

TABLE 8 DEWEY number		
Dewey number	Number of Records	Percent
no number	226	75.6%
303	1	0.3%
741	63	21.1%
791	1	.3%
813	4	1.3%
823	1	.3%
843	1	.3%
940	2	.7%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

TABLE 8A DEWEY number when the **F** in **M/F/B** is **1** (FICTION)		
Dewey number	Number of Records	Percent
no number	177	93.7%
741	6	3.2%
813	4	2.1%
823	1	.5%
843	1	.5%
TOTAL	189	100.0%

See Table 4 for a fuller explanation of the fiction code.

Dewey Decimal Classification, edition 20

300 Social Sciences
    303 Social Processes

700 The arts
    740 Drawing & Decorative arts
        741 Drawing and Drawings
            741.5 Cartoon, caricatures, comics
    790 Recreational & performing arts
        791 Public performances
        (other than musical, sport, game performances)

800 Literature & rhetoric
    810 American literature in English
    813 Fiction
    820 English & Old English literatures
        823 English fiction
    840 Literatures of Romance languages
        843 French fiction

900 Geography and history
    940 General history of Europe

Dewey 303 is Title 16[rec 20]	Brought to light	F1436
Dewey 791 is Title 66[rec 250]	Alien...	
Dewey 813 is Title 133[rec 117]	Love shots	
Dewey 813 is Title 148[rec 125]	The silver metal lover	
Dewey 813 is Title 135[rec 295]	Elfquest	PS3566
Dewey 813 is Title 2[rec 5]	Thieves World...	PS3551
Dewey 823 is Title 61[rec 278]	Great expectations	
Dewey 843 is Title 30[rec 298]	The hunting party	
Dewey 940 is Title 162[rec 198]	Maus...	
Dewey 940 is Title 162[rec 195]	Maus...	D 810

Dewey numbers are not usually given to fiction with the exception of literature. Only 24.4% of the graphic novel records received a Dewey number. Of these records, 21.1% were for "Comic books, strips, etc.". This leaves only 3.3% of the records in a Dewey classification that addresses the content, rather than the form.

There are two interpretations for the 75.6% of the records without a Dewey number. The first is that graphic novels are considered fiction and are not assigned a number. The second,

and more likely is that many libraries classify in LC and not in Dewey. Dewey libraries are more likely to be smaller and public and often do not have the funds to catalog on OCLC.

One solution would be for Dewey to add a special subdivision to 741.5 for graphic novels which would allow them to be shelved together. Graphic novels are often quite slim, which leaves little spine space for a classification number. Putting them in fiction will require a number to be put in oversize shelving since many are larger than traditional fiction hardcovers.

TABLE 9 Other Form		
	Number of Records	Percent
YES	127	42.5%
NO	172	57.5%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

The graphic novel can be conceived and created as one single work though many have a prior history in another form. A cataloger should transcribe this history for the material to be cataloged, but many graphic novels lack bibliographic information.[1] The "Marvel Graphic Novel" series, with over 40 different titles published often illustrates this lack.[2] All four examples are either based on or continue a comic book title. For example, Title 33 is considered to be the prologue for the successful "The New Mutants" comic book. Title 157 is designed to fit between two issues of the comic book "Dazzler". This is not information available on the item or catalog record.

In terms of publishing history we see that; the graphic novel can be an adaptation of a book or movie[3], be originally published as a multivolume work (comic book mini-series)[4], be a

---

1. Table 9 resulted from information from the OCLC catalog record as well as other sources. Consider at least 42.5% of the records have a prior history in another form.

2. i.e. Titles 33,97,157,165, etc.

3. i.e. Title 95, The call of the wild or Title 50, Willow: the official comics....

4. i.e. Title 60, Black Orchid or Title 112, Batman : the dark knight returns.

reprint of a few issues of a comic book[1], or for each episode of the graphic novel being published as a serialization in a magazine[2].

Ideally, each cataloging record should give this background. In practical terms, this means entries in the NOTES with subsequent added entries. The lack of indexes for graphic novels leaves the cataloging record as a vital source of information regarding the history of the graphic novel.

A look at Title 173, Conan of the Isles underscores some of the problems. Conan was created by Robert E. Howard, who committed suicide after writing 17 Conan stories. Conan's immense popularity brought many other authors to continue the Conan saga. One is Conan of the Isles by L. Sprague DeCamp and Lin Carter which was adapted into two issues of the comic book Conan the barbarian (1982?). This was reprinted as a "Marvel Graphic Novel". In order to effectively catalog it, the cataloger added two 500 fields: "Featuring the character created by Robert E. Howard." and "Adapted from the novel Conan of the isles by L. Sprague DeCamp and Lin Carter." in order to give added entries. The patron now knows that the graphic novel is based on the book. The graphic novel has no mention of its earlier existence as part of Conan the barbarian in the graphic novel itself.

---

1. i.e. Title 173, Conan of the isles.

2. i.e. Title 58, Barbarella or Title 120, Moebius: the collected fantasies....

. TABLE 10 "Graphic Novel" mentioned in ...		
	Number of Records	Percent
TITLE	2	2.4%
NOTES	10	11.8%
SERIES	76	89.4%
TOTAL	85	103.6%[1]

Authors, publishers and catalogers are interested in bringing out the form of the work. This allows the buyer or patron to find it easier. Since graphic novels are an emerging form, one would expect the word "graphic novel" to be prominent. Publishers can indicate this by title, jacket blurbs or series titles. Catalogers can indicate this by notes or subject headings.

There are 299 graphic novel records in this paper, of these, only 85 have the word "graphic novels" in the OCLC record. Title 6, Robotech, the graphic novel and Title 182, The Southern Knights graphic novel are the only records with "graghic novel" in the titles. Title 6 is based on an immensely popular Japanese animated TV show which spun off into American takeoffs. The graphic novel is considered a prologue to the TV show and takeoffs. Title 182, which reprints the comic book, has an OCLC 500 field note in order to bring out a cover title. The word "graphic novel" appears seven times in the cover, blurb, and

---

1."graphic novels" appeared in both Title & Notes for one record and in Notes & Series for two records.

forward of the book.[1] Later reprints, Title 181, change the title to Early days of the Southern Knights and eventually drops using "graphic novels" in describing itself.

There are ten records that have the word "graphic novel" in a 5xx OCLC field(Notes). The notes, in part, are; "a color compilation of the first 3 Thieves World graphic novels", "a badger graphic novel", "graphic novels based on...", "at head of title ... graphic novel", "on cover : 'The ... graphic novel'", "'... computer generated graphic novel'--cover", "First Graphic novel". Four of the records are DLC generated. This does help to bring out the form of the work. Without a legitimate subject heading for graphic novels inclusion of the term in a 5xx field would significantly help in the accuracy of the cataloging record.

There are 76 uses of the term in series statements. The most prolific series is Marvel Graphic Novel. Unfortunately for catalogers and readers, this series is not always known for heavy use of forwards, blurbs, biographies, CIP, provenance or other useful items. The series has published over 40 titles. Many other comic book publishers are printing their own graphic novel series, however, without knowing the name of the series, retrieval is difficult. Boolean searching of series names is not possible with all on line catalogues.

As of now, the evidence is that the word "graphic novel" is more likely to be listed in series instead of in title or notes.

---

[1]. Henry Vogel & Butch Guice, The Southern Knights, the graphic novel (New York , N.Y. : Fictioneer, 1986).

TABLE 11 Number of Subject Headings		
Number of SH	Number of Records	Percent
0	188	62.9%
1	73	24.4%
2	26	8.7%
3	7	2.3%
4	2	.7%
5	0	.0%
6	3	1.0%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

TABLE 11A Number of Subject Headings not visual in type[1]		
Number of SH not visual	Number of Records	Percent
0	89	80.2%
1	10	9.0%
2	8	7.2%
3	3	2.7%
4	1	.9%
TOTAL	111	100.0%

---

[1]. i.e. does not have "Comic books, strips, etc.".

TABLE 11B Number of Subject Headings When **F** in **M/F/B** is 1(fiction)		
Number of SH not visual	Number of Records	Percent
0	132	69.8%
1	43	22.8%
2	11	5.8%
3	2	1.1%
4	1	.5%
TOTAL	189	100.0%

See Table 4 for a fuller explanation of **M/F/B**.

6 Subject Headings: Title 16[rec 20] Brought to light
6 Subject Headings: Title 16[rec 21] Brought to light
6 Subject Headings: Title 46[rec 50] Conquering armies
4 Subject Headings: Title 50[rec 45] Willow...
4 Subject Headings: Title 158[rec 280] Moby Dick

The Library of Congress does not assign many subject headings to works of fiction. This can be evidence that graphic novels are considered fiction since 62.9% of the records do not have subject headings. There are 172 subject headings with 77.3% of them having "Comic books, strips, etc". This drops to 43.6% if the work is considered fiction.[1] Only 22.7% of the subject headings do not have "Comic books, strips, etc".

Along with the classification number, this is an overworked designation. "Comic books, strips, etc." is simply too broad a subject heading. Graphic novels need a "Graphic novel" subject heading. There is strong precedence for creating a form based

---

[1] Table 11B.

subject heading of this type.

Fotonovelas are a form of the novel. As Scott puts it;

> Fotonovelas are an important medium in Latin America, as well as in France and the rest of Mediterranean Europe and North Africa. Fotonovelas appear and are produced similarly to comic books, except the word balloons are pasted on photographs rather than included in drawings. Actors and actresses can build reputations by appearing in fotonovelas, and it is not uncommon for popular singers or other celebrities to appear as guest stars.[1]

The legitimacy of the form has caused the Library of Congress to adopt it as a subject heading

Fotonovela (May Subd Geog)
UF Fotoromanzo
Photo novels
Photoroman
BT Comic books, strips, etc.
Popular literature
Stories without words[2]

A similar subject heading for graphic novels might look something like this;

Graphic novels (May Subd Geog)
UF Comic book novels
BT Comic books, strips, etc.
Popular literature
Stories without words

This will allow a subject heading for graphic novels considered fiction by the cataloger. Otherwise its use as a free-floating subdivision would be more appropriate.

---

1. Scott, Comics Librarianship, 113.

2. Library of Congress Subject Headings 13th ed.

TABLE 12 Total number of people responsible		
Number Responsible	Number of Records	Percent
0	1	.3%
1	66	22.1%
2	81	27.1%
3	65	21.7%
4	37	12.4%
5	23	7.7%
6	10	3.3%
7	10	3.3%
8	2	.7%
9	3	1.0%
10	0	0.0%
11	0	0.0%
12	1	.3%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

TABLE 13 Are all "role's" indicated		
	Number of Records	Percent
YES	173	57.9%
NO	126	42.1%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

TABLE 14 Total number of people traced		
Number Traced	Number of Records	Percent
0	1	.3%
1	86	28.8%
2	120	40.1%
3	69	23.1%
4	18	6.0%
5	4	1.3%
6	0	0.0%
7	1	.3%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

There are 871 people responsible for the 299 records. This is an average of 2.9 people mentioned in each cataloging record. The number traced (main entry and added entries) drops to only 632 individuals. This leads to only 2.1 people traced per record.

Some catalogers only put in the statement of responsibility those entries that will receive added entries. Any look at the graphic novels indicates that this is occurring to some degree with many of the cataloging records. Title 112, Batman: the dark knight returns has eighteen individuals playing different roles. One record lists six individuals and traces five. Three records list five individuals and traces one, three or four respectively. One record lists three individuals and traces three.

Roles are important. An artist contributes more to the work than a letterer or an inker. Cataloging records that do not list the roles for each individual make interpreting the record harder. Table 13 indicates that 42.1% of the records either have no roles listed or leave out some. If AACR2 increases the number of roles that should be traced, cataloging records with the fuller lists will be easier to modify if retrospective cataloging takes place.

TABLE 15 Mentioned in record, but not traced		
	Number of Records	Percent
Orig. Author	7	6.7%
Writer	3	2.9%
Artist	42	40.4%
Letterer	41	39.4%
Editor	25	24.0%
Translator	34	32.7%
Other	38	36.5%
TOTAL	104	182.6%

Many records have more than one role not traced.

Table 15 is based on questions #20-#26 of the coding form.

Orig. Author stands for Original Author of the work the graphic novel is based on. AACR2 rule 21.12
Writer includes Writer/Adapter AACR2 rule 21.30C
Artist includes Colorist/illustrator/painter/artist Rule 21.30K2
Letterer includes Calligrapher/letterer
Other stands for a role not listed above

AACR2 rules regarding "works that are modifications of other works" are Rule 21.9-21.23. Rule 21.9 keeps the same main entry if "... the modification is an updating, rearrangement, abridgment, or revision where the original person or body is still represented as being responsible". Rule 21.10 has the main entry under the adapter. This has the same effect as Rule 21.16A which has the main entry under the adapter if an "Art work" is adapted from one medium to another. Rule 21.11 has the main entry under author if a work is illustrated. Rule 21.24 says that in collaborative efforts between an artist and a writer,

rather than an artist's illustration of a writer's text, main entry is under the one named first.

To summarize, there should be added entries for the original author, writer and artist. A number of graphic novels use the term "illustrator" instead of artist. Rule 21.30K2 makes added entries for illustrators only if "the illustrations occupy half or more of the item" or "the illustrations are considered to be an important feature of the work". The illustrations in most if not all graphic novels consist of more than half the item and are an indispensable part of the form.

Translators would not be traced in many graphic novels according to rule 21.30K1. Editors receive added entries except for editors of a series (rule 21.30D). The expected outcome for Table 15 would be that original author, writer and artist would be heavily traced. The large number of artists not traced came as a surprise. A closer role of the coding name of "Artist's" has a role of "Colorist/Color" that received few added entries. There are 42 records in "Artist" with 36 of them belong to "Colorist". This leaves eight records or 7.7% of the illustrators, painters, or artists without added entries.

Some of the roles in the "Other" list are; cover, introduction, as told to, assistant, designer, with special thanks, art director, creator, creator of character, based on series created by, production assistant, a cura de, film by, title designer, Stan Lee presents..., commentary, afterwards, etc. Even in a less cluttered medium, some of these roles would still not get an added entry.

Graphic novels suffer several barriers to person added entries. The statement of responsibility and notes in the OCLC record is often edited from the graphic novel. Added entries are not made for all of the individuals in the statement of responsibility and roles that are not expressly mentioned in AACR2 are often ignored.

On line systems allow an expansion of access points. A separate catalog card does not have to be produced for each added entry. Even if extra added entries are not made for the plethora of roles, listing people and roles in the statement of responsibility of the notes allows boolean searching. Therefore, a cataloging record for OCLC should be as complete as possible; member libraries can always delete information for their on line systems.

TABLE 16 Holdings records				
Holdings on OCLC	Number of Records	Percent	Total Holdings	Percent
1	78	26.1%	78	2.3%
2	59	19.7%	118	3.4%
3	41	13.7%	123	3.6%
4	21	7.0%	84	2.5%
5	16	5.4%	80	2.3%
6	14	4.7%	84	2.5%
7	6	2.0%	42	1.2%
8	2	.7%	16	.5%
9	4	1.3%	36	1.0%
10	4	1.3%	40	1.2%
11	1	.3%	11	.3%
12	1	.3%	12	.4%
13	5	1.7%	65	1.9%
14	2	.7%	28	.8%
15	1	.3%	15	.4%
16	2	.7%	32	.9%
17	3	1.0%	51	1.5%
18	4	1.3%	72	2.1%
20	2	.7%	40	1.2%
23	3	1.0%	69	2.0%
24	1	.3%	24	.7%
25	2	.7%	50	1.5%
28	1	.3%	28	.8%
30	1	.3%	30	.9%
31	1	.3%	31	.9%
32	3	1.0%	69	2.8%
33	1	0.3%	33	1.0%
35	1	.3%	35	1.1%
36	1	.3%	36	1.1%
37	2	.7%	74	2.2%
38	2	.7%	76	2.2%
39	1	1.3%	39	1.1%
40	1	1.3%	40	1.1%
50	1	.3%	50	1.5%
57	1	.3%	57	1.7%
64	1	.3%	64	1.9%
73	1	.3%	73	2.1%
75	1	.3%	75	2.2%
76	1	.3%	76	2.2%
118	1	.3%	118	3.5%
138	1	.3%	138	4.0%
139	1	.3%	139	4.1%
147	1	.3%	147	4.3%
150	1	.3%	150	4.4%
641	1	.3%	641	18.8%
TOTAL	299	100.0%	3416	100.0%

There are a total of 3416 holding records for only 191 titles. This is impressive when considering that graphic novels are mostly works of fiction, are similar in looks to comic books, and are not always easy to catalog correctly. The six graphic novels with individual record holdings of over 100 are:

Title 162[rec 195]	Maus...	641 holdings
Title 112[rec 202]	Batman: the dark ...	150 holdings
Title 20[rec 272]	The man of steel	147 holdings
Title 113[rec 99]	Batman: year one	139 holdings
Title 135[rec 295]	Elfquest	138 holdings
Title 189[rec 190]	Steven King's creepshow	118 holdings

Maus... has the most holdings. It is also the most talked about graphic novel in literary circles. Batman: the dark knight returns revived and changed the treatment of Batman by DC comics. The man of steel continues the saga of Superman. Elfquest along with Cerebus and Teenage mutant ninja turtles launched the publishing of black and white comics. Steven King is one of the more popular and bankable authors publishing in fiction.

Since the OCLC records were downloaded, the holding records must be growing. The list and ranking of the records can therefore change. Cataloging records on OCLC are subject to revision and change. This is true of member records as well as DLC copy.

CONCLUSION

Graphic novels are a blending of words and art. The illustrations in a graphic novel bear the same relationship to the text that a film carries to its screenplay. A concise definition that satisfies all conditions is as probable as a definition of the novel that fits all cases. The forces that restrict comic books and other related formats in the United States is waning. The increasingly international aspect of OCLC will result in more overseas cataloging of graphic novels.

There are several conclusions that can be drawn from the graphic novels in this study.

1) Many are considered fiction.[1]

2) They are not automatically considered juvenile works.[2]

3) At least 24.4% are translations.[3]

4) Most are classed with comic books, many by author.[4]

5) At least 42.5% existed as an earlier, other format.[5]

6) "Graphic novel" appears in 28% of the records, mostly in a series statement.[6]

---

[1] Table 4.

[2] Table 5.

[3] Table 6.

[4] Table 7.

[5] Table 9.

[6] Table 10.

7) Only 37.1% of the records have subject headings, most for "Comic books, strips, etc.".[1]

8) Cataloging records list on average 2.9 people per record but trace only 2.1 people per record.[2]

9) Added entries are often provided for roles listed in AACR2, but often are not provided for roles not listed.[3]

This is an indication that there are inconsistencies in the cataloging of graphic novels. In order to standardize the records, a number of recommendations can be made on the cataloging of graphic novels.

1) **Chiefly ill.** should be used in the physical description field.

2) A subject heading **Graphic Novels** should be used locally until the Library of Congress adopts one.

3) Libraries might want to class graphic novels together in a local addendum to "Comic books, strips, etc." or in a special section of fiction books, but it is not likely that the Library of Congress will.

3) More individuals and roles should be listed in the statement of responsibility or notes.

The main recommendation is the use of a **Graphic Novel** subject heading, based on the similar subject heading **Fotonovelas**. It should be a Form subject heading only in the absence of other subject headings, otherwise its use as a Free-Floating subdivision would be more appropriate. Failing that, include graphic novels in the notes.

---

[1]. Table 11 and Table 11A.

[2]. Table 12 and Table 14.

[3]. Table 15.

APPENDIX

GRAPHIC NOVEL TITLES USED FOR ANALYSIS

All titles are from Bowling Green State University's locally assigned subject heading of "Graphic Novels". The list was obtained in October of 1990. These titles were then searched against OCLC records and downloaded. There are 191 titles, with 299 OCLC records. Different OCLC records for the same title can have variant main entries or other inconsistencies. For this reason, the format mostly follows BGSU's main entry.

There are more graphic novels than the 191 searched here, however BGSU has the largest known list compiled using a single definition.

FORMAT of record

Title number
Main Entry (OCLC 100 tag)
Title (OCLC 245 tag)
Record number/OCLC number (all records from OCLC Books Format unless otherwise indicated)

001
Aragones, Sergio
The Death of Groo
001/18107740

002
Asprin, Robert
Thieves' World graphics
002/12420420
003/13215151
004/16679046
005/12555172
006/16679028
007/15790879
286/13817634 SERIES RECORD

003
Bagge, Peter
The Best of Neat Stuff
008/19617961

004
Baker, Kyle
Through the Looking Glass
009/21115846

005
Baron, Mike
Hexbreaker
010/18424135

006
Baron, Mike
Robotech, The Graphic Novel
237/14928262

007
Baron, Mike
The World of Ginger Fox
011/16470978

008
Barr, Mike W.
Batman, son of the Demon
014/18107744

009
Barreiro, Ricardo
Moving Fortress
012/20075578

010
Bates, Cary
Nightwings: a graphic adaptation
013/13668016

011
Beautemps, Andre
Michael Logan
254/17281150

012

Beowulf
215/11084125

013
Bilal, Enki
The Woman Trap
015/19096863
016/22069302

014
Bloch, Robert, 1917-
Hell on Earth
211/12869114
212/13794064

015
Boucq, Francois
Pioneers of the human adventure
017/21129448
018/17179750
019/20973505

016

Brought to light
020/18741555
021/22227602

017
Brunner, Frank
Frank Brunner's Seven Samuroid
022/12151608

018
Busch, Jeffrey
Rip Van Winkle
283/22447206

019
Byrne, John
The Earth Stealers
023/18062384

020
Byrne, John
The Man of Steel
270/14262465
271/17614286
272/17399178

021
Caza
Escape from suburbia
238/16931291

022
Charlier, Jean-Michel
Bluberry's secret
027/20653187

023
Charlier, Jean-Michel
The Man With the Silver star
239/11503105

024
Charlier, Jean-Michel
A Yankee named Bluberry
024/13011502
025/21565961
026/15843126

025
Charyn, Jerome
The Magician's wife
028/18286[illegible]0
029/18260965
030/17181617

026
Chaykin, Howard
Blackhawk
031/17868778

027
Chaykin, Howard
The swords of heaven
217/6176819

028
Chaykin, Howard
Time^2, the epiphany
032/15546925

029
Chaykin, Howard
Time^2, the satisfaction of Black Mariah
033/18326261

030
Christin, Pierre
The hunting party
298/21415441
299/11638840

031
Christin, Pierre
The Ranks of the Black Order
034/20493787
035/11638654

032
Claremont, Christoper
Marada the she-wolf
036/13410047

033
Claremont, Chris
The new mutants
242/11511396

034
Claremont, Chris
Stan Lee presents the Uncanny X-Men: Days of Future Past
037/20653173

035
Claremont, Chris
X-Men : God loves, man kills
245/11511344

036
Cockrum, Dave, 1943-
The Futurians
219/11488608
220/17884394

037
Colon, Ernie
The Medusa chain: a graphic novel
232/11726737
233/11511453

038
Corben, Richard
Richard Corben's Never Where
191/4059624
192/11854611

039
Cover, Arthur Byron
Space Clusters
038/14636571

040

Crossroads
039/18397170

041
Cunningham, Dennis
Tales from the plague
040/15554094

042
DeFalco, Tom
The saga of the alien costume
041/18980095

043
DeMatteis, J. M.
Doctor Strange--Into Shamballa
042/14470739

044
DeMatteis, J. M.
Greenberg the Vampire
043/13104300

045
DeMatteis, J. M.
Moonshadow
044/20625879

046
Dionnet
Conquering Armies
249/4473275

047
Drake, Stan
The Million dolar hit
226/11688981
227/18436387

048
Drake, Stan
One, two, three... die!
225/10352721

049
Duffy, Jo
The Punisher in assassin's Guild
048/19478800

050
Duffy, Jo
Willow: the official comics...
045/18517897
046/18118301
047/18883562

051
Dumas
L'heritier de Rochemont
049/20106501

052
Durand, Rene, 1948-
Operation chisteras
050/18660615

053
Eastman, Kevin B.
Teenage Mutant ninja turtles
051/15309328

054
Eisner, Will
A Contract With God
169/11450019
170/11560301
171/11486195
172/11450840
173/11450823
174/11419701
175/14155521
176/05376616
177/16527630
178/20695642
179/11450828

055
Eisner, Will
Will Eisner's The Dreamer
235/15554328

056
Feiffer, Jules
Feiffer, the collected works
052/21170225
053/22170584

057
Ferrer, Miguel
The dreamwalker
054/21170218

058
Forest, Jean Claude
Barbarella
180/9787387
181/2793748
182/19297317
183/13203880
184/17724940

059
Forest, Jean Claude
Barbarella, the moon child
185/4824213
186/5961742
187/15922130

060
Gaiman, Neil
Black Orchid
287/20666804 SERIES RECORD

061
Geary, Rick
Great Expectations
278/21217951

062
Geary, Rick
Wuthering Heights
284/22447193

063
Gerber, Steve, 1947
Void indigo
224/11488634

064
Glanzman, Sam
A sailor's story
055/18038947

065
Goines, Donald, 1937-1974
Daddy Cool
230/12685086

066
Goodwin, Archie
Alien: the illustrated story
250/5216143

067
Grant, Steven, 1953-
The Count of Monte Cristo
285/21888022

068
Grant, Steven, 1953-
Hamlet
281/21923421

069
Grant, Steven, 1953-
The Island of Dr. Moreau
282/22447231

070
Grant, Steven
Twilight Man
059/20575682

071
Grell, Mike
Green Arrow: the longbow hunters
057/17288213
058/20495553

072
Hamme, Van, 1939
Thorgal, the archers
056/15163300

073
Hampton, Scott
Pigeons from hell
060/20173468

074
Harras, Bob
Nick Fury vs. S.H.I.E.L.D.
061/20666692

075
Hedden, Rich
Framed
062/19488118

076
Herman
The survivors
223/11429764
253/17281146

077
Homer
Ulysses
246/4635859
247/18056353
248/15782017

078
Hudnall, James D.
Lex Luthor: the unauthorized biography
063/20534211

079
Ibarrola, Jose
Orphee: d'apres l'opera de Claudio Monteverdi
252/17281144

080
Jacobs, Edgar P.
The Time Trap
064/20625907
065/20666707
066/20678085
067/17743752

081
Janson, Klaus
Frost and Fire
068/13702553

082
Jippes, Daan
Who Framed Roger Rabbit
069/19694207

083
Jodorowsky, Alexandro
The Incal
070/19048156
071/11652965
072/11652952

084
Jones, Bruce
Arena
073/20443939

085
Jones, Bruce
Silverheels
074/18039030

086
Jones, Bruce
Somerset Holmes
075/16569891
076/20702893

087
Kirby, Jack
The Hunger Dogs
193/11853762

088
Kirby, Jack
La Legion de la terreur
077/10585738

089
Kozure Okami
Lone wolf and cub
079/19738371
288/17052067 SERIES RECORD

090
Lawrence, Don
Storm
255/17281160
256/18040439

091
Layton, Bob
Hercules, prince of power
078/18660467

092
Lee, Elaine
Starstruck: the Luckless, the abandoned and the forsaked
080/12810094

093
Leloup, Roger
The Three suns of Vina
081/21170261
082/22485582

094
Lob, Jacques
Candice at sea
083/4618729

095
London, Jack, 1876-1916
The Call of the Wild
279/22192388

096
McGregor, Don
Detectives Inc. in a remembrance of threatening green
188/7150927

097
McGregor, Don
Killraven, Warrior of the worlds
243/11510543

098
McKie, Angus
So beautiful and so dangerous
084/5881968

099
Maggin, Elliot S.
Star raiders
209/11973345
210/10587817

100
Magnus, Gunter Hugo
Necron
274/21129468

101
Manara, Milo
An author in search of six characters
085/20666767
086/20839624

102
Mantlo, Bill
Cloak and Dagger in Predator and prey
088/21117870

103
Mantlo, Bill
Swords of the Swashbucklers
087/172811

104
Marx, Christy
The sisterhood of steel
089/18107820

105
Mattotti, Lorenzo
Fires
097/18285223

106
Mezieres, J. C.
Ambassador of the Shadows
090/9956966

107
Mezieres, J. C.
Heroes of the Equinox
091/11501323
092/19458694

108
Mezieres, J. C.
Les oiseaux du maitre
093/17743728
094/17281168

109
Mezieres, J. C.
World without stars
095/10327235
096/19458684

110
Michelinie, David
The Aladdin effect
244/12496090

111
Michelinie, David
Revenge of the living monolith
098/12534696

112
Miller, Frank
Batman : The dark knight returns
199/14203785
200/20023605
201/21157578
202/15058354
203/17230592

113
Miller, Frank
Batman: year one
099/18827514
100/17759045

114
Miller, Frank
Daredevil in Love and War
101/18624565
102/14989028

115
Miller, Frank
Daredevil--Born Again
273/17614369

116
Miller, Frank
Frank Miller's Ronin
103/16931743
104/17466069

117
Mills, Pat
Metalzoic
105/13727684

118
Moebius, 1938-
Heavy Metal presents Moebius
207/9043362

119
Moebius, 1938-
The magic crystal
106/21927466
289/20666778 SERIES FORMAT

120
Moebius, 1938-
Moebius: the collected fantasies of Jean Giraud
208/17637607

121
Moorcock, Michael
Michael Moorcock's Elrick, the dreaming city
213/12020092
214/9063946

122
Moore, Alan, 1951-
Batman: the killing joke
107/19353535

123
Motter, Dean
The prisoner
290/20551740 SERIES FORMAT

124
Munoz, Jose
Joe's bar
108/17614097

125
Muth, Jon J.
Dracula, a symphony in moonlight and nightmares
228/17842093
229/16307597

126
Nedaud
Zorro in old California
109/18286466
110/18193383

127

Night music
240/12401319
291/7018084 SERIES RECORD

128
Nocenti, Ann
The Inhumans
111/18980120

129
Nocenti, Ann
Somewhere strange
112/18980139

130
Oliphant, David
Solarman, the beginning
113/6323647

131
O'Neil, Dennis, 1939-
Batman: The official comic adaptation of the Warner Bros....
114/20277341

132
O'Neil, Dennis, 1939-
The 1941 Shadow: Hitler's astrologer
115/18262532
116/20296135

133
Paringaux, Philippe
Love shots
117/19244689

134
Pini, Wendy
Beauty and the Beast: portrait of love
118/20211825

135
Pini, Wendy
Elfquest
292/15494075
293/15494103
294/15494120
295/7573020
296/19606232
297/15703444

136
Ploog, Michael
The Adventures of Tom Sawyer
276/22146164

137
Pohl, Frederik
The merchants of Venus
216/13713050

138
Potter, Greg
Me & Joe Priest
120/12639920

139
Potts, Carl
The Alien Legion-- A Grey Day to Die
119/14983408

140
Potts, Carl
The Last of the Dragons
121/20584876

141
Powell, Martin
Scarlet in gaslight
122/21129352

142
Pratt, Hugo
Les Celtiques
268/7359737
269/22471223

143
Pratt, Hugo
Corto Maltese
258/19689600
259/12891899
260/20584924
261/16693096
262/14983314
263/14470191
264/14983218

144
Pratt, Hugo
Corto Maltese en Siberie
265/11853591
266/17057821
267/19474626

145
Pratt, Hugo
Sgt. Kirk
257/17281165

146
Putney, Susan K.
The amazing Spider-Man in Hooky
123/13754900

147
Randall, Ron
Trekker
124/19479155

148
Robbins, Trina
The silver metal lover
125/11754774

149
Rogers, Marshall
Demon with a glass hand
126/16307565

150
Russell, P. Craig
Ariane and Bluebeard
127/20604803

151
Russell, P. Craig
Scarlet Letter
275/21426907

152
Saenz, Mike
Iron Man: crash
128/20666729
129/20525873

153
Shanower, Eric
The enchanted apples of Oz
130/14339276

154
Shanower, Eric
The forgotten forest of Oz
131/19414981

155
Shanower, Eric
The ice king of Oz
132/18039212

156
Shanower, Eric
The secret island of Oz
133/16931660

157
Shooter, Jim
Dazzler, the movie
134/17281175

158
Sienkiewicz, Bill
Moby Dick
280/21420070

159
Simonson, Walter
Star Slammers
221/11510424

160
Skeates, Steve
Warlords
135/14636626

161
Snyder, John K.
Dr. Jekyll & Mr. Hyde
277/21868827

162
Spiegelman, Art
Maus; a survivor's tale
195/13524314
196/17775342
197/21302303
198/20866056

163
Starlin, Jim
Batman: a death in the family
136/19237680

164
Starlin, Jim
Batman: the cult
137/20666666
138/21335992

165
Starlin, Jim
The Death of Captain Marvel
241/10161242

166
Starlin, Jim
Dreadstar
222/11511507

167
Starlin, Jim
Gilgamesh II
139/20666794

168
Starlin, Jim
The Incredible Hulk and the Thing in the big change
251/17281142

169
Stenstrum, James
Sherlock Holmes: Sir Arthur Conan Doyle's a Study in Scarlet
140/20604839

170
Steranko, 1938-
Red Tide : a Chandler novel
194/4278988

171
Stevens, Alec
The sinners
141/20604777

172
Stevens, Dave
The Rocketeer: an album
142/12755508
143/16523833
144/19928758

173
Thomas, Roy
Conan of the isles
145/19493624

174
Thomas, Roy
The Dragonlance saga
146/18081648
147/18811844
148/19245191

175
Thorne, Frank
Ghita of Alizarr
149/12729929
150/15543732

176
Torres, Daniel, 1958-
Triton: the adventures of Rocco Vargas
151/18070588
152/14941223

177
Trillo, Carlos
Alvar Mayor, death and silver
153/20432258
154/20584863

178
Truman, Timothy
Time Beavers
155/12226848

179
Vance, W.(William)
Where the Indian walks
156/21129414

180
Veitch, Rick
Heartburst
231/11501268

181
Vogel, Henry
Early days of the Southern Knights
157/20584903
158/15580472
159/18262502
160/18262529
161/19781971
162/18937437
163/19917008

182
Vogel, Henry
The southern Knights graphic novel
164/14927917

183
Wagner, Matt
Grendel : Devil by the deed
204/16525297
205/14993900

184
Wagner, Matt
Grendel : The devil inside
206/21201433

185
Waldron, Lamar, 1954-
Lightrunner: an epic science fiction adventure
234/9682248

186
Wildey, Doug
Rio
165/16925914

187
Wilson, Colin, 1949-
Rael: Into the Shadow of the Sun
166/17996062
167/20188819

188
Wilson, Ron
Super boxers
218/10587724

189
Wrightson, Berni
Stephen King's creepshow
189/11962045
190/8682546

190
Zelenetz, Alan
Kull: the vale of shadow
168/21129394

191
Zelenetz, Alan
The raven banner: a tale of Asgard
236/12019871

BIBLIOGRAPHY

NOTE: Some articles from the vertical files at Ohio State University did not have complete citations.

Beahm, George. "Graphic Novels: Comics, Magazines, or Books?" Publishers Weekly November 6, 1987: 22.

Berman, Sanford, ed. Cataloging Special Materials: Critiques and Innovations. Phoenix, Arizona: Oryx Press, 1986.

Bodian, Nat G. Bodian's Publishing Desk Reference: A Comprehensive Dictionary of Practices and Techniques for Book and Journal Marketing and Bookselling. Phoenix: Oryx Press, 1988.

Condon, Garret. "Graphic Novels Appeal to New Generation of Comic-Book Readers." [Vertical file at OSU]

Dreifus, Claudia. "An Interview with Art Spiegelman." Progressive November 1989: 34-37.

DeCandido, Keith R. A. "Picture This: Graphic Novels in Libraries." Library Journal March 15, 1990: 50-55.

Devreux, Anne Shapiro. "Biff Wham Bam!: Call it Bandes Dessinee or Graphic Novel, it's the Newest Belgian Winner!" Belgian American Trade Review : 18-21.[Vertical file at OSU]

Dorrell, Larry D. "Why Comic Books?" School Library Journal Nov. 87: 30-32

Du Mars, Roger Dean. "The Comic Book Grows Up, Graphic Novels: Not Just Kid Stuff." Christian Science Monitor December 28, 1988: [Vertical file at OSU]

Eisner, Will. Comics & Sequential Art. Tamarac, Florida: Poorhouse Press, 1985.

Gopnik, Adam. "Comics and Catastrophe." New Republic June 22, 1987: 29-34.

"Growing Up into 'Graphic Novels'." The New York Times January 31, 1988: [Vertical file at OSU]

Hoffman, Frank. "Comic books in Libraries, Archives and Media Centers." Serials Librarian 16 (1/2) 1989: 167-198.

Levine, Art. "Comic Books are Winning New Respect." U.S. News and World Report Sept 21, 1987:69.

Levine, Beth. "Graphic Novels: The Latest Word in Illustrated Books." Publishers Weekly May 22, 1987: 45-47.

Lovece, Frank. "Carnal Comics." Genesis May 1989: 70-73.

Miller, Frank. Batman : The Dark Knight Returns New York, NY : Warner Books, 1986. ISBN 0-446-38505-0

Myers, George Jr. "Graphic Novels Return." [Vertical file at OSU]

_____. "Rough & Randy: Comics for Adults Nothing to Laugh About." [Vertical file at OSU]

Nicholls, Peter, ed. The science fiction encyclopedia Garden City, NY : Doubleday, 1979. 672.

"Out of the Ghetto, Into the Mainstream." The New York Times January 31, 1988: [Vertical file at OSU]

Prescott, Peter S. and Ray Sawhill. "The Comic Book (Gulp!) Grows Up." Newsweek January 18, 1988: 70-71.

Richler, Mordecai. "Batman at Midlife: Or, the Funnies Grow Up." The New York Times Book Review May 3, 1987: 35.

Schwartz, John. "Comic Books Grow Up." Newsweek on Campus October 1987: 38-40.

Scott, Randall. Comics Librarianship: a handbook. Jefferson, North Carolina: McFarland, 1990.

Sinberg, Stan. "Comic Relief." Daily News : 3-4.[Vertical file at OSU]

_____. "Holy Toledo! Comic Books Have Grown Up." The Plain Dealer Magazine June 17, 1990: 12-13.

Spiegelman, Art. "Maus & Man." Village Voice June 6, 1989: 20-22.

Thompson, Don. "The spawn of the son of M.C. Gaines." The comic-book book 290-317.

Towle, Lisa H. "What's New in The Comic Book Business." The New York Times January 31, 1988: [Vertical file at OSU]

Walker, Gregory. "Comics and Graphic Novels." Booklist April 1, 1989: 1370-1374.

Wertham, Fredric. Seduction of the Innocent. New York: Rinehart, 1954.

Computer Citations/CD-Rom Citations

Amazing Heroes. Stamford, CT: Zam, OCLC #7616065.

The Comics Buyer's Guide. Iola, WI: Krause Publications, OCLC #9185196.

The Comics Journal. Bethel, CT: The Comics Journal, OCLC #4521305.

Fauvel, Marie-Louise. "L'Aventure D'Une Ecriture: La Bande Dessinee D'essai." (Ph.D. diss., University of Wisconson, 1989) [French Text] 200, Dialog, Dissertation Abstracts International, #01100712.

Holman, Curtis Lehner. "Reinventing the Wheel: A Multi-Perspective Analysis of Alan Moore and Dave Gibbon's Graphic Novel 'Watchmen'." (M.A. diss., University of Georgia, 1989), Dialog, Dissertation Abstracts International, #01099187.

Moore, Alan & Dave Gibbons ill. & letterer, John Higgins colorist. Watchmen. New York: DC Comics, 1986. OCLC # 15063233.

_____. Watchmen. New York: DC Comics, 1987. OCLC #17257135.

_____. Watchmen. New York: DC Comics, 1987. OCLC # 18203911.

_____. Watchmen. New York: Warner books, 1987. OCLC #17301724.

Spiegelman, Art. Maus: A Survivor's Tale. New York: Pantheon Books, 1986. OCLC #13524314.

_____. Maus: A Survivor's Tale. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1987. OCLC #17775342.

_____. Maus: A Survivor's Tale. London: Deutsch, 1987. OCLC #21302303.

_____. Maus: Racconto di un Sopravvissuto. Milano: Rizzoli. 1989. OCLC #20866056.

Catalogues/Price guides

Classic DC Graphic Novels Catalog. Canada: Diamond Comic Distributors, 1989.

Direct Currents. #30. New York: DC Comics, June 1990

Eclipse Books. Forestville, CA: Eclipse Books, 1989.

The Fantasy Collection. May 1990.

Mail Order Catalog. Spring/Summer 1990. Princeton, WI: Kitchen Sink Press.

Overstreet, Robert M. Official Overstreet Comic Book Price Guide. 18th ed. New York: House of Collectibles, 1988.

The Premium Specialty Collection. October 1990.